



Inter-Departmental Communication

Office of the City Auditor

Date: March 21, 2013

To: Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council

From: Gary L. White, City Auditor *Gary L. White*

Subject: Kansas City International Airport Shuttle Bus Workforce Performance Information

Resolution 120847 directs the city auditor to compile available performance information on the KCI shuttle bus service workforce related to absences, number of accidents, and customer service complaints for the periods October 2011 through February 2012 and October 2012 through February 2013.

We did not analyze or draw any conclusions from the data and our work does not constitute an audit under Government Auditing Standards. We appreciate the courtesy and cooperation of the Aviation Department staff throughout the project. The team for this project was Joyce Patton and Deborah Jenkins.

OBJECTIVE

Our objective was to compile available performance information on the KCI shuttle bus service workforce related to absences, number of accidents, and customer service complaints for the periods of October 2011 through February 2012 and October 2012 through February 2013.

WORK PERFORMED

Our methods included:

- Meeting with Aviation staff to learn what performance information is available on the KCI shuttle bus service workforce related to absences, number of accidents, and customer service complaints.

- Collecting and compiling available performance information related to absences, number of accidents, and customer service complaints for the two periods under review.
- Testing the reliability of the Aviation Department’s data on time worked and time not worked by bus operators by reviewing the queries the Aviation Department used to extract the data from the PeopleSoft system and comparing them to our own queries.
- Compiling absence data by calculating the hours not worked as a percentage of hours worked by shuttle bus operators for the two periods under review.

BACKGROUND

The Kansas City Aviation Department’s shuttle bus service provides transportation for travelers at the Kansas City International Airport (KCI) between airport terminals and airport parking areas. At the August 16, 2012 Transportation and Infrastructure Committee meeting, the director of aviation discussed Ordinance No. 120706, which would authorize outsourcing the KCI shuttle bus service.¹ The aviation director has identified bus operator absences, which results in overtime expenses, and bus accidents as problems that increase the department’s costs of operating the shuttle bus service.

Before voting on Committee Substitute for Ordinance 120706, the City Council directed the City Auditor’s Office to compile available performance data on absences, number of accidents, and customer service complaints for two comparable five-month periods to see whether improvements in the performance of the current bus operator workforce can be accomplished quickly.

RESULTS

Absences

The KCI shuttle bus service is a 24/7 operation. The Aviation Department considers any leave time, whether planned in advance or unplanned, as an absence because it must replace the bus operator on leave with another in order to maintain a level of service.

The Aviation Department provided data on hours worked and hours not worked by each bus operator during the two periods under review. We verified the reliability of the data by reviewing Aviation’s PeopleSoft queries and comparing the results to the results of our own PeopleSoft queries. We found no material differences in our query results.

¹ Committee Substitute for Ordinance No. 120706 would authorize a five-year contract with two one-year renewal options with Standard Parking to manage and operate the shuttle bus operations at Kansas City International Airport. The total budget for seven years is \$26,763,434.

To show the extent of bus operator absences, we calculated the hours not worked as a percentage of the total hours worked.² (See Exhibit 1.) To compute time not worked by bus operators, we summed the hours that were coded as leave time in PeopleSoft. To compute the hours worked, we summed the hours that were coded as worked time in PeopleSoft. Since the Aviation Department must replace bus operators on leave, no matter the reason for the absence, our calculation includes both leave time that was planned (such as vacation days, free days, etc.) and leave that was unplanned (such as sick leave, unpaid dock, bereavement leave, etc.). We did not draw any conclusions about the results of the calculations.

Exhibit 1. Hours Not Worked as a Percentage of Hours Worked

Month	2011-2012	2012-2013
October	18%	16%
November	18%	14%
December	12%	14%
January	19%	14%
February	23%	20%
Percentage for Period	18%	15%

Source: PeopleSoft Time Reporting Data and City Auditor's Office Calculations.

Accidents

The Aviation Department provided documentation for all of the accidents they reported to us (i.e., accident report forms, bus operator statements, photographs, etc.). We were unable to verify that we received information on all accidents that occurred because there is not an independent source we could use for comparison.

The accidents include those that involved a shuttle bus and a third party (i.e., either a passenger on the bus or an object or person struck by a bus), as well as accidents that did not involve a third party. We compiled the total number of accidents by month for the two periods under review. (See Exhibit 2.)

Exhibit 2. Total Accidents by Month

Month	2011-12	2012-13
October	1	2
November	4	1
December	1	4
January	3	3
February	2	0
Total	11	10

Source: Aviation Accident Reports.

We did not attempt to establish cause or responsibility for the accidents (i.e., inclement weather, bus operator error, equipment malfunction, etc.). We also did not draw any conclusions about the number of shuttle bus accidents in the two periods.

² We are using the total hours worked by shuttle bus operators as a proxy for the hours that were needed to maintain a minimal level of shuttle bus service.

Complaints

The Aviation Department receives complaints about shuttle bus service primarily through phone calls and through a comment form on the Aviation Department's website that people complete and submit to the department in an email. We compiled complaint data from the documentation provided by the Aviation Department.³ The documentation included copies of emails from customers and complaint forms completed by staff who took phone calls from customers with complaints. There were also handwritten notes documenting the Aviation Department's follow up with customers and bus operators. We compiled the number of shuttle bus service complaints for the two periods under review. (See Exhibit 3.)

Exhibit 3. Total Complaints by Month

Month	2011-12	2012-13
October	9	3
November	2	6
December	3	6
January	5	3
February	5	7
Total	24	25

Source: Email Correspondence between Customers and Aviation Staff and Complaint Forms.

Most complaints were about the amount of time the customer had to wait for a bus. There were also complaints about drivers being rude, buses not stopping to pick up customers, unsafe driving practices, and overcrowded buses. We did not attempt to establish the legitimacy of the complaints. For example, a person may complain that a bus passed him or her by without stopping. While this could have been the result of bus operator negligence, it could also have been that the bus was already full or the bus operator was going off shift. We did not draw any conclusions concerning the number and nature of complaints about the shuttle bus service.

The number of complaints for both periods may be underrepresented. The Aviation Department also receives complaints through social media such as Twitter or Facebook. Complaints received through social media are not included in Exhibit 3 for either period because this information is saved for only a limited time. The social media complaints for October 2011 through February 2012 were not available for comparison to October 2012 through February 2013.

³ We also searched the Action Center's 311 database for complaints related to airport shuttle buses. We found none.