



Inter-Departmental Communication

Office of the City Auditor

Date: March 16, 2020
To: Councilwoman Katheryn Shields
From: Douglas Jones, City Auditor 
Subject: Human Relations Department Comparative Staffing and Budget Information

This is in response to your request for comparative staffing and budget information on the city's Human Relations Department (HRD). You asked us to research other cities staffing and budget levels for a department or program similar to the city's HRD as well as the general nature of the work performed by those similar departments or programs to assist the Mayor and City Council in this year's budget discussions.

This memo does not constitute an audit under *Government Auditing Standards*.

Summary

Although the comparison cities may have similar departments or programs, direct comparisons to the work performed by Kansas City's Human Relations Department may be difficult as these cities developed departments, programs, and activities to meet their jurisdictions' needs. Table 1 summarizes the results of our research on comparison cities' staffing, budgeting, and activities similar to those performed by Kansas City's Human Relations Department (HRD). Additional information about the comparison cities is on the following pages. We make no conclusions from the data provided.

Table 1: Comparison Cities Budget, Staff, and Activities Compared to Kansas City's Human Relations Department

Comparison Cities	Fiscal Year	Total City Budget	Program Budget	Total FTEs	Kansas City HRD Activities			
					M/W/DBE Program	Construction Workforce	Prevailing Wage	Civil Rights Complaints
Milwaukee, WI	2020	\$1,611,266,719	\$363,288	6.0	●	●	●	●
Indianapolis, IN	2020	\$1,212,269,739	\$812,969	9.0	●			●
Omaha, NE	2020	\$1,121,093,114	\$1,258,020	10.0	●	●		●
Baltimore, MD	2020	\$3,555,401,780	\$2,477,594	21.0	●		●	●
Kansas City, MO	2021	\$1,734,836,821	\$2,866,339	29.5	●	●	●	●
Minneapolis, MN	2020	\$1,536,200,000	\$2,911,000	17.6	●	●	●	●
Chicago, IL	2020	\$11,652,400,000	\$3,046,294	32.0	●		●	●
Memphis, TN	2020	\$1,295,684,916	\$3,791,000	29.0	●		●	●
Denver, CO	2020	\$2,303,424,000	\$5,352,049	48.0	●		●	●
St. Louis, MO	2020	\$1,149,300,000	\$11,462,473	27.0	●	●		●
Fort Worth, TX	2020	\$1,985,882,287	unk	unk	●			●
Oklahoma City, OK	2020	\$1,544,632,069	unk	unk	●			●
Tulsa, OK	2020	\$854,532,000	unk	unk	●			●
Atlanta, GA	2020	\$2,215,976,755	unk	unk	●		●	●

Sources: Cities' most recent adopted or submitted budget and City Auditor's Office information requests to comparison cities.
 Note: Some cities have not responded to our requests for additional information and information we have not received is shown as 'unk'.

Methodology

Kansas City’s HRD activities include Minority/Women/Disadvantaged Business Enterprise certification and compliance, prevailing wage compliance, minority and women workforce compliance, and investigation of civil rights violations. Using our list of 10 comparison cities (Denver, Fort Worth, Indianapolis, Memphis, Milwaukee, Minneapolis, Oklahoma City, Omaha, St. Louis, and Tulsa) plus Atlanta, Baltimore, and Chicago we reviewed adopted budgets from these cities to identify departments or programs similar to HRD. We also contacted staff in some comparison cities to clarify budget information or identify where similar departments or programs were placed in their budgets.

We compiled information on staffing and budget levels and the general nature of the work performed by similar departments or programs in the comparison cities. We did not verify the reliability or validity of the information we collected. Some cities have not yet responded to our requests for information and information we have not received is noted as ‘unk’ in the following tables.

What We Found

Kansas City, Missouri, has a Human Relations Department that administers the city’s Minority/Women/Disadvantaged Business Enterprise program, monitors construction workforce and prevailing wage compliance, and investigates civil rights complaints. (See Table 2.)

Table 2: KCMO Human Relations Department Budget and Staffing

Kansas City Program/Activity	Budget	FTE	Kansas City HRD Activities			
			M/W/DBE Program	Construction Workforce	Prevailing Wage	Civil Rights Complaints
Administration	\$548,387	4.0				
Civil Rights	\$416,038	5.0				●
Human Rights Commission	\$21,640	0.0				
MBE/WBE Monitoring	\$1,666,419	18.0	●	●	●	
Development Compliance	\$77,465	1.0	●	●	●	
Labor Monitoring	\$136,390	1.5				
Totals	\$2,866,339	29.5				

Source: Kansas City 2021 Submitted Administration and Personnel Budgets and City Website.

Denver, Colorado, has an Anti-Discrimination Office within its Human Rights and Community Partnership Department that conducts Civil Rights investigations for discrimination claims related to employment, housing, public accommodations, education, and health and welfare services. Denver has a Small Business Opportunity Division within its Economic Development and Opportunity Department that certifies small, minority- and women-owned business as well as establishes and monitor participation goals for projects undertaken by the city along with other responsibilities. The Prevailing Wage Section of the Denver City Auditor’s Office investigates and enforces the city’s prevailing wage rate. (See Table 3.)

Table 3: Denver FTE & Budget Comparable to KCMO HRD

Denver Program/Activity	Budget	FTE	Kansas City HRD Activities			
			M/W/DBE Program	Construction Workforce	Prevailing Wage	Civil Rights Complaints
Small Business Opportunity Division	\$3,270,877	29.0	●			
Anti-Discrimination Office	\$109,685	1.0				●
City Auditor’s Office-Prevailing Wage	\$1,971,487	18.0			●	
Totals	\$5,352,049	48.0				

Source: Denver 2020 Submitted Budget and City Website.

Fort Worth, Texas, has a Civil Rights Enforcement Division in the Diversity & Inclusion Department that administers Civil Rights enforcement activities and programs. The city has an Office of Business Diversity in its Economic Development Department that administers Minority and Small Business Enterprise programs. Because the city's budget does not break down FTE's and dollars by divisions, we were unable to determine how either Department allocates staff and budget amongst its divisions or programs. (See Table 4.)

Table 4: Fort Worth FTE & Budget Comparable to KCMO HRD

Fort Worth Program/Activity	Budget	FTE	Kansas City HRD Activities			
			M/W/DBE Program	Construction Workforce	Prevailing Wage	Civil Rights Complaints
Civil Rights Enforcement Division	unk	unk				●
Office of Business Diversity	unk	unk	●			
Totals	unk	unk				

Source: Fort Worth 2020 Adopted Budget and City Website.

Indianapolis, Indiana, has an Office of Minority & Women Business Development that implements the city's Minority-, Women-, Veteran-, and Disabled-owned Business Enterprise Program. The office also conducts studies to support these efforts. The Office of Equal Opportunity within the Office of Corporation Counsel investigates Civil Rights complaints related to discrimination in employment, housing, public accommodation, and education. The city's budget does not detail this office separately from the Office of Corporation Counsel. (See Table 5.)

Table 5: Indianapolis FTE & Budget Comparable to KCMO HRD

Indianapolis Program/Activity	Budget	FTE	Kansas City HRD Activities			
			M/W/DBE Program	Construction Workforce	Prevailing Wage	Civil Rights Complaints
Office of Minority & Women Business Development	\$812,969	9.0	●			
Office of Equal Opportunity	unk	unk				●
Totals	\$812,969	9.0				

Source: Indianapolis 2020 Adopted Budget and City Website.

Memphis, Tennessee, has an Office Equal Business Opportunity & Compliance in the Finance Department that certifies businesses and administers contract compliance for Equal Business Opportunity Programs, Small Business Enterprise Programs, Minority- and Women-Owned Business Programs, in addition to other services. The city has an Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion Division in the Human Relations Department that investigates internal Civil Rights discrimination complaints related to city workers in addition to developing policies and programs to promote a fair and inclusive workplace. The city also has a Prevailing Wage Office that monitors prevailing wage laws for city contracts. (See Table 6.)

Table 6: Memphis FTE & Budget Comparable to KCMO HRD

Memphis Program/Activity	Budget	FTE	Kansas City HRD Activities			
			M/W/DBE Program	Construction Workforce	Prevailing Wage	Civil Rights Complaints
Office of Equal Business Opportunity & Development Program	\$1,631,347	14.0	●			
Equity, Diversity, Inclusion Division	\$1,321,600	9.0				●
Prevailing Wage Office	\$838,053	6.0			●	
Totals	\$3,791,000	29.0				

Source: Memphis 2020 Adopted Budget and City Website

Milwaukee, Wisconsin, has an Office of Small Business Development that certifies business and monitors compliance with Small Business Program goals and requirements and a residential preference program. There is no Minority- or Women-Owned business classification. The city recently elected to eliminate duplicate Civil Rights related services provided by other federal and state agencies. The city has an Equal Rights Commission with staffing that helps develop policies and internal accountability related to Civil Rights issues and a small staffing contingent to assist with filing complaints at other agencies. The city’s Purchasing Division enforces and monitors prevailing wage issues. (See Table 7.)

Table 7: Milwaukee FTE & Budget Comparable to KCMO HRD

Milwaukee Program/Activity	Budget	FTE	Kansas City HRD Activities			
			M/W/DBE Program	Construction Workforce	Prevailing Wage	Civil Rights Complaints
Office of Small Business Development	\$238,816	4.0	●	●		
Equal Rights Commission	\$124,472	2.0				●
Purchasing Division	unk	unk			●	
Totals	\$363,288	6.0				

Source: Milwaukee 2020 Adopted Budget and City Website.

Minneapolis, Minnesota, has a Contract Compliance Division within the Department of Civil Rights that monitors construction and development, commodities and supplies, and professional and technical services contract by enforcing related local and federal civil rights and wage laws and policies. These include Minority-, and Women-Owned Business goals, minority and female employment goals, and prevailing wage laws. The city has a Complaint Investigation Division in the Civil Rights Department that investigates Civil Rights discrimination complaints related to employment and other city anti-discrimination laws or policies. (See Table 8.)

Table 8: Minneapolis FTE & Budget Comparable to KCMO HRD

Minneapolis Program/Activity	Budget	FTE	Kansas City HRD Activities			
			M/W/DBE Program	Construction Workforce	Prevailing Wage	Civil Rights Complaints
Contract Compliance	\$2,190,000	10.96	●	●	●	
Complaint Investigation	\$721,000	6.63				●
Totals	\$2,911,000	17.59				

Source: Minneapolis 2020 Adopted Budget and City Website.

Oklahoma City, Oklahoma, has a Small and Disadvantaged Local Business Program that is administered within the Public Works Department. The program has no dedicated staff, but activities are handled by a project manager on a project-by-project basis. Non-ADA Civil Rights complaints are administered by the Municipal Counselor’s Office and Personnel Department, but there are no specific divisions or staff assigned to these functions. Prevailing Wage contractual requirements are handled as part of the contracting process by individual departments. (See Table 9.)

Table 9: Oklahoma City FTE & Budget Comparable to KCMO HRD

Oklahoma City Program/Activity	Budget	FTE	Kansas City HRD Activities			
			M/W/DBE Program	Construction Workforce	Prevailing Wage	Civil Rights Complaints
Small and Disadvantaged Local Business Program	unk	unk	●			
Municipal Counselor’s Office and Personnel Department	unk	unk				●
Totals	unk	unk				

Source: Oklahoma City 2020 Adopted Budget and City Website.

Omaha, Nebraska, has an Economic Equity and Inclusion Division in the Human Rights and Relations Department that administers the Small and Emerging Business Program to promote workforce development and training opportunities in areas of high unemployment and below median income areas of Omaha among other responsibilities. The Civil Rights Investigation and Enforcement Support Services, also in the Human Rights and Relations Department, investigates and enforces Civil Rights discrimination complaints related to housing employment, public accommodation, and contracting. (See Table 10.)

Table 10: Omaha FTE & Budget Comparable to KCMO HRD

Omaha Program/Activity	Budget	FTE	Kansas City HRD Activities			
			M/W/DBE Program	Construction Workforce	Prevailing Wage	Civil Rights Complaints
Economic Equity and Inclusion Program	\$924,816	unk	●	●		
Civil Rights Investigation and Enforcement Support Services	\$333,204	unk				●
Totals	\$1,258,020	10.0				

Source: Omaha 2020 Adopted Budget and City Website.

St. Louis, Missouri, pays for two positions at the Airport Disadvantaged/Minority/Women Business Enterprise program to certify Minority/Women-Owned businesses. The St. Louis Development Corporation is responsible for monitoring and enforcing DBE/MBE/WBE goals in city contracts, however they do not indicate how many staff they allocate to this role. Neither the city nor these outside agencies specify the costs for these positions. The city has a Civil Rights Enforcement Agency that investigates complaints related to fair housing, equal employment, and public accommodations. The St. Louis Agency on Training and Employment monitors construction workforce goals in addition to other training responsibilities. (See Table 11.)

Table 11: St. Louis FTE & Budget Comparable to KCMO HRD

St. Louis Program/Activity	Budget	FTE	Kansas City HRD Activities			
			M/W/DBE Program	Construction Workforce	Prevailing Wage	Civil Rights Complaints
St. Louis Agency on Training and Employment	\$11,003,649	19.0		●		
Civil Rights Enforcement Agency	\$458,824	6.0				●
St. Louis Airport D/M/WBE	unk	2.0	●			
St. Louis Development Corporation	unk	unk	●			
Totals	\$11,462,473	27.0				

Source: St. Louis 2020 Adopted Budget and City Website.

Tulsa, Oklahoma, has an Office of Resilience and Equity under the Mayor that investigates Civil Rights complaints related to discrimination in housing, employment, or public accommodations. The office also administers a small business enterprise program. (See Table 12.)

Table 12: Tulsa FTE & Budget Comparable to KCMO HRD

Tulsa Program/Activity	Budget	FTE	Kansas City HRD Activities			
			M/W/DBE Program	Construction Workforce	Prevailing Wage	Civil Rights Complaints
Office of Resilience and Equity	unk	unk	●			●
Totals	unk	unk				

Source: Tulsa 2020 Adopted Budget and City Website.

Atlanta, Georgia, has an Office of Contract Compliance in the Mayor’s Office that serves as a liaison, linking Small, Minority, Female and Disadvantaged Businesses with City of Atlanta related business opportunities and encourages equal opportunity for all businesses and individuals in the Atlanta workplace. The city has a Human Relations Commission and an Office of Constituent Services under the Mayor that receive, investigate, and make recommendation for the resolution of complaints alleging discrimination, including racial profiling and other violations of the city’s Human Relations Code. (See Table 13.)

Table 13: Atlanta FTE & Budget Comparable to KCMO HRD

Atlanta Program/Activity	Budget	FTE	Kansas City HRD Activities			
			M/W/DBE Program	Construction Workforce	Prevailing Wage	Civil Rights Complaints
Office of Contract Compliance	unk	unk	●		●	
Human Relations Commission	unk	unk				●
Totals	unk	unk				

Source: Atlanta 2020 Submitted Budget and City Website.

Baltimore, Maryland, has a Minority and Women’s Business Opportunity Office in the Law Department that certifies and monitors Minority/Women-Owned Firms compliance with relevant city programs. The city has a Civil Rights Division in the Office of Equity and Civil Rights that investigates Civil Rights discrimination complaints related to housing, employment, education, and public accommodation. The city has a Wage Commission within the Civil Rights Division that monitors prevailing wage, minimum wage, and other wage related issues in the city. (See Table 14.)

Table 14: Baltimore FTE & Budget Comparable to KCMO HRD

Baltimore Program/Activity	Budget	FTE	Kansas City HRD Activities			
			M/W/DBE Program	Construction Workforce	Prevailing Wage	Civil Rights Complaints
Minority and Women's Business Opportunity Office	\$491,949	5.0	●			
Wage Commission	\$682,981	6.0			●	
Civil Rights Division	\$1,302,664	10.0				●
Totals	\$2,477,594	21.0				

Source: Baltimore 2020 Adopted Budget and City Website.

Chicago, Illinois, has a Contract Monitoring and Certification Division in Procurement Services that certifies and monitors Minority/Women/Veteran-Owned Businesses compliance with the city’s M/W/VBE program. The Commission on Human Relations that enforces the Chicago Human Rights Ordinance and the Chicago Fair Housing Ordinance. The Commission investigates Civil Rights complaints to determine whether discrimination occurred and uses its enforcement power to punish acts of discrimination. (See Table 15.)

Table 15: Chicago FTE & Budget Comparable to KCMO HRD

Chicago Program/Activity	Budget	FTE	Kansas City HRD Activities			
			M/W/DBE Program	Construction Workforce	Prevailing Wage	Civil Rights Complaints
Contract Monitoring and Certification Division	\$1,955,026	21.0	●		●	
Commission on Human Relations	\$1,091,268	11.0				●
Totals	\$3,046,294	32.0				

Source: Chicago 2020 Adopted Budget and City Website.

cc: Mayor Quinton Lucas
 Members of the City Council
 Earnest Rouse, Acting City Manager